## CHAPTER 12 CHANGE OF JUDGE FOR CIVIL AND CRIMINAL CASES

Trial Rules 76 and 79

CONTACT:

## Tom Carusillo

tcarusil@courts.state.in.us Direct: 317-233-2779 30 S. Meridian St., Suite 500 Indianapolis, IN 46204 Main: 317-232-2542

Fax: 317-233-6586

A change of judge in a civil case can arise in two basic scenarios: (1) a motion for change of judge under <u>Ind. Trial Rule 76</u>, and (2) disqualification or recusal under <u>Ind. Trial Rule 79</u>(C).

Prior to July 1, 1995, upon the recusal of a judge, a special judge was selected either by certifying the matter to the Supreme Court or by the recusing judge naming a three member panel from which the parties struck. Effective July 1, 1995, the selection process was changed, and selection of a special judge was accomplished according to local rule. This procedure was further refined, effective February 1, 1996, to permit parties to either agree upon a special judge or to allow the recusing judge to name a special judge.

Even though the authority of a recusing judge to name a striking panel has long since ended, some judges are still unaware of the current procedure.

The process for selecting a special judge pursuant to a change of judge or a recusal is now different. The chart below lays out the steps:

Trial Rule 76 - Change of Judge	Trial Rule 79 Disqualification/Recusal
1. T.R. 79(D): Selection by agreement of the parties	1. T.R. 79(D): Selection by agreement of the parties
2. T.R. 79(E): With the agreement of the parties, selection by trial judge	2. T.R. 79(E): With the agreement of the parties, selection by trial judge
3. T.R. 79(F): Striking panel. The selected judge is not required to accept the case	
4. T.R. 79(H): Local Rule. The selected judge must accept the case unless disqualified, ineligible or excused	3. T.R. 79(H): Local Rule. The selected judge must accept the case unless disqualified, ineligible or excused.

courts.IN.gov 1

It is important to note that selection of a special judge due to disqualification or recusal is only a three-step process and does not utilize a striking panel. The most common error made by a recusing judge is to name a striking panel for the selection of a special judge, rather than, in the absence of an agreement, referring to the county's local rule.

It is also important to note that Ind. Trial Rule 79(H) was amended to permit inclusion of judges from outside the administrative district on the list of judges used to select a special judge under local rule. Judges from outside the administrative district must be from a county contiguous to the county seeking the special judge. In addition, these judges can be a part of the selection list only if they have agreed to be included.

If a special judge is not obtained pursuant to local rule, or if the particular circumstances of the case warrant, the case may be certified to the Supreme Court for the appointment of a special judge.

## **Change of Judge for Criminal Cases**

A change of judge in a criminal case is controlled by <a href="Ind. Criminal Rule 13">Ind. Criminal Rule 13</a>. In counties with four or more judges who receive felony or misdemeanor cases, a special judge is selected in the same manner used to select the original judge. In counties with fewer than four judges, the local rule required by <a href="Ind. Criminal Rule 2.2">Ind. Criminal Rule 2.2</a> must include an alternative assignment list with judges from contiguous counties and senior judges assigned to the court. Criminal Rule 13(C).

Where no judge is available for appointment under local rule or the particular circumstances of the case warrant, a trial judge may request the Supreme Court to appoint a special judge.

Last modified 7/13/10

courts.IN.gov 2